

10am, Tuesday, 9 December 2014

Closure of Duncan Place including implications for Leith Primary School

Item number	7.9
Report number	
Executive/routine	Executive
Wards	Leith

Executive summary

Following a succession of issues emerging regarding the condition of the building, the Duncan Place building was closed in September 2014 to allow intrusive surveys to be conducted. Users of the building (community centre, nursery and school gym hall) were relocated to alternative locations to allow the continued delivery of these services in the area. Surveys have now been concluded with significant issues being identified with the building fabric.

It is proposed to make interim nursery provision through the delivery of a temporary unit within the school playground while gym provision has been made in a local church hall. Community users have been relocated throughout the Leith area. As a result of the further survey work undertaken on the fabric of the building, it is estimated that around £3.48m would be required to refurbish the building. It is therefore proposed that the existing building be demolished and development of options for new build accommodation commenced. This will to be reported in Spring 2015.

Links

Coalition pledges	P40
Council outcomes	CO19, CO25
Single Outcome Agreement	SO4

Closure of Duncan Place including implications for Leith Primary School

Recommendations

- 1.1 Committee is recommended to:
- (i) note the proposal to install a temporary unit to deliver nursery facilities at Leith Primary School, increasing capacity from 40 to 60 places;
 - (ii) note the temporary arrangements put in place for the delivery of PE for Leith Primary School;
 - (iii) approve the immediate demolition of the existing Duncan Place building;
 - (iv) approve that further work is undertaken on the scoping of options to provide long term accommodation; and
 - (v) request a further report in Spring 2015 on the long term options.

Background

- 2.1 The Duncan Place building houses a community centre and the gym hall and nursery accommodation for Leith Primary School, sharing a site with the primary school. The building was constructed in the 1920s as a technical block, and has previously been used as Leith Academy accommodation. The building was converted to accommodate a community centre some thirty years ago, alongside the primary school functions.

Main report

- 3.1 Duncan Place was surveyed as part of the comprehensive Children and Families estate survey undertaken in 2012/13. Each establishment was rated on a scale of A-D with A being “best”, in line with Scottish Government guidance. Duncan Place was the only building rated condition D in the Children and Families estate, with an estimated £2.3m of maintenance works being required to upgrade the building. The cost of repair and upgrade per square metre was substantially higher than any other building in the estate.
- 3.2 This position was reported to the Education, Children and Families Committee on 10 December 2013 as part of the conclusion of the estate wide review. This review sought and received approval of a five year capital investment programme to address back-log maintenance. Duncan Place was referenced in

the report as follows: “This has been excluded from the programme at this stage to allow time for consideration of solutions for this area”.

- 3.3 Following the failure of a wall at Liberton High School on 1 April 2014, an estate wide inspection of all free standing walls, and any other building defects of concern, was undertaken. As a result of this inspection, elements of the Duncan Place building were closed for use until they were made safe. This included the short term closure of the school’s gym hall, and elements of the outside of the building were fenced off to protect from falling render.
- 3.4 A structural survey of the building was undertaken in May 2014. This reported that the building was structurally fair but identified a number of issues that required further investigation and monitoring.
- 3.5 During the summer of 2014, planned works were undertaken at Leith Primary School. Inspection of the Duncan Place building at height as a consequence of the school works revealed further issues with the building. Further measures were taken to make the roof safe and scaffolding was put in place to provide protective decking. However further emerging issues with the state of the roof led Council officers to take the decision to close Duncan Place as a precaution in September 2014 for further intrusive investigative surveys to take place.
- 3.6 Initial intrusive surveys have now been completed, which have identified significant issues associated with wet and dry rot throughout the building, particularly affecting the roof. In addition, water ingress has caused cracking, swollen timbers and dampness in a number of areas. The survey has identified previous works and treatments to address rot which appears to be an ongoing issue. In addition to the rot and dampness, there are issues with the external render, window sills, dormer windows, cornice and gable wall.
- 3.7 To bring the building back into use, it is anticipated that the following works would be required as a minimum:
 - Replacement of the roof structure and roof lights, the various areas of rot and water damage may involve replacement of the roof structure in part or fully, including redesigning the timber structure to make it more rigid for maintenance and ongoing safety. This would also require a temporary roof structure while works were undertaken.
 - Replacement of all dormers and windows, and structural improvements are required.
 - Re- rendering the building throughout.
 - Stonework stabilisation and re-pointing for all elevations, which may involve structural engineering input to resolve movement.
 - Fire upgrade work including replacing the existing fire exit stair and creating a second means of escape.
 - Installation of a lift to comply with equalities legislation.
 - Rot treatment works requiring a full strip back to ensure all rot is eradicated.
 - Full mechanical & electrical upgrade.

- 3.8 Further scaffolding has had to be erected to provide additional protection due to the unstable condition of dormers on the upper levels. This, and other scaffolding previously erected, will provide a level of protection but there are still health and safety concerns, for example, in the event of a storm. Vacant property also carries the risk of fire.
- 3.9 The current estimate for full repair is £3.48m and this is expected to escalate once the full intrusive surveys have been completed and further deterioration of the fabric anticipated during the winter months. Whilst due diligence on a new build has not been completed, it is clear that this will be the preferred option. Consequently, it is proposed to proceed with the demolition of the existing building at this time.

Statutory reprovision – Primary School uses

- 3.10 The Duncan Place building delivers two statutory functions. The gym hall is necessary to deliver the compulsory two hours of PE per child per week. Nursery provision is required under the Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014 which places a duty on the local authority to provide early learning and childcare. Eligible children are aged 3 and 4 years old who can commence from the term after their third birthday. Some two year olds are also eligible.
- 3.11 In order to deliver an immediate solution for nursery provision, those with places at Leith Primary School were relocated to Stanwell Nursery School in September 2014. There are now 102 children from both Stanwell Nursery and Leith Primary School Nursery Class attending Stanwell and they currently have 18 places free to allocate. From January 2015, there will be 62 children on waiting lists for nurseries across the Leith area.
- 3.12 A number of options were evaluated in order to address the shortfall in nursery places anticipated from January 2015. These included adaptation of the existing primary school building, off site conversion of alternative buildings, provision of additional nursery places at other nurseries and off or on site delivery of a temporary unit.
- 3.13 It was concluded that the preferred option, that delivered the best accommodation in the shortest timescale in the most convenient location, was the delivery of a temporary nursery unit in the Leith Primary School playground. This option, along with the other options, was shared with the Parent Council at their meeting on 8 October 2014, with the delivery of the temporary unit being the Parent Council's favoured option.
- 3.14 Given the short timescales associated with the delivery of the unit and the fact that the Council would fail its statutory duties in providing nursery places from January 2015 if a solution was not delivered, it was agreed that this unit would be procured through a waiver report.
- 3.15 The temporary unit is scheduled to be operational in February 2015 (the shortest possible timescale for its installation). New children (who have not been allocated a place at the other nurseries in the area) will be informed that a

nursery place will become available in February 2015 on completion of the temporary installation.

- 3.16 The opportunity was taken to increase the capacity of the nursery from 20:20 places to 30:30 places as part of this project which will address the pressure on nursery places being experienced in the area. Despite being housed in a temporary unit, with modern construction standards now required, the nursery environment is likely to be significantly enhanced over that offered by the Duncan Place building.
- 3.17 The length of time the temporary unit will be in operation will be dependent on the long term solutions.
- 3.18 Alternative PE arrangements for P2 – P7 pupils were arranged in the United Reform Church Hall on Duke Street. The Head Teacher indicated his preference for this as it is closest to the school. A School Support Assistant has been employed to assist the staff and children in the walk to and from the hall and in supporting the class teacher with the lesson.
- 3.19 The Head Teacher also expressed a wish for PE for Primary 1 pupils to take place in a classroom in the school. This is being facilitated through some building adaptations and will be ready for January 2015.
- 3.20 Active school coordinators will continue to work with the Head Teacher looking at physical activity for the children of Leith Primary School.

Community Centre Users Reprovision

- 3.21 Duncan Place Resource Centre (DPRC) hosted 49 community groups, adult education classes, children and young people activities and 22 English Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) provided by Edinburgh College. The venue hosted Edinburgh College and Community Learning and Development (CLD) staff as well as resources. CLD staff have engaged with all users to find alternative accommodation that would continue to meet their needs within Leith and surrounding areas. The majority of users accepted the new accommodation offered and a few found their own accommodation. CLD worked in partnership with Edinburgh College to meet their needs and at present a temporary solution has been found for their staff and classes.
- 3.22 Two groups (Upholstery and Look & Draw) have still to be relocated. It is proving challenging to relocate Upholstery because they upholster sofas/arm chairs and other large items of furniture and to date no venue has been able to provide the storage required. Another group (Look & Draw) has not yet accepted alternative accommodation.
- 3.23 Discussions have taken place with the Chair of Edinburgh College to get a fuller understanding of their position.
- 3.24 Appendix 1 illustrates the destination of relocated community user groups from DPRC. The DPRC Management Committee are currently carrying out a review

with the relocated groups regarding their new accommodation. All accommodation has been offered on a temporary basis.

Long term options

- 3.25 As previously noted the condition of the building is such that a refurbishment will not be the most economic option, both in terms of cost and restraints of dealing with a building envelope that is not purpose built nor fit for purpose. Consequently, work is currently being carried out on the scope of what new provision be required, including an expanded nursery, gym hall and other necessary accommodation. This will require further development and it is proposed to report further in Spring 2015 on the long term options.

Measures of success

- 4.1 A long term accommodation solution for the delivery of the functions provided in Duncan Place is required. This requires to be appropriate for the services the Council delivers in this area.

Financial impact

- 5.1 The cost of delivering a new temporary nursery has been estimated at £171,000 (including removal costs once it is replaced with permanent accommodation). This will be met from the Children and Families general Early Years revenue budget.
- 5.2 The lease associated with the Church Hall providing P2-P7 PE space during term time is £8,300 per annum. Adaptations to the room for P1 PE have been costed at £15,000.
- 5.3 All costs associated with the temporary relocation of DPRC users/groups are currently being met from the under spend of support costs associated with DPRC i.e. cleaning, SSO cover, heating lighting, waste disposal etc.
- 5.4 £387,000 is currently set aside in the capital investment programme for the provision of a lift in the building. It is proposed that this amount be used to fund the demolition.
- 5.5 Detailed costs have yet to be developed for new build alternatives, and this will be reported further in March 2015.
- 5.6 The report outlines immediate proposed capital expenditure plans of £0.387m for the demolition of Duncan Place, subject to this being linked to a new build facility on the cleared site. If this expenditure were to be funded fully by borrowing, the overall loan charges associated with this expenditure over a 20 year period would be a principal amount of £0.387m and interest of £0.253m, resulting in a total cost of £0.640m based on a loans fund interest rate of 5.1%. The annual loan charges would be £0.032m.

- 5.7 It should be noted that the Council's Capital Investment Programme is funded through a combination of General Capital Grant from the Scottish Government, developers and third party contributions, capital receipts and borrowing. The borrowing required is carried out in line with the Council's approved Treasury Management Strategy and is provided for on an overall programme basis rather than for individual capital projects. Following instruction from Members, notional loan charge estimates have been provided above, which it should be noted are based on the assumption of borrowing in full for this capital project.
- 5.8 As a budget of £0.387m relating to Duncan Place forms part of the approved capital investment programme, provision for funding it will be met from the revenue loans charges budget earmarked to meet the overall capital investment programme borrowing costs.

Risk, policy, compliance and governance impact

- 6.1 A long term accommodation solution for the delivery of the functions provided in Duncan Place is required including statutory functions relating to the school nursery and gym hall provision.
- 6.2 The risk of retention of the existing Duncan Place building relates to health and safety matters with a continued risk of building failure until it is either made safe or demolished. Bringing forward the demolition will mitigate this risk.

Equalities impact

- 7.1 The closure of Duncan Place has led to a short period of time when services could not be offered to user groups, thus having a detrimental effect on these users. However, almost all of the users have now been accommodated elsewhere, the exceptions being a drawing group and an upholstery group. There is an impact on ease of access to the relocated services as travel patterns have had to change to reflect the new locations.
- 7.2 The Council has been able to mitigate the loss of accommodation for the statutory school uses to ensure that PE can continue to be provided for all pupils and nursery places are provided in the immediate area, indeed the temporary solution will see an increase in locally available places to meet rising demand.

Sustainability impact

- 8.1 The fabric of the existing Duncan Place building is very poor and accordingly the building is extremely inefficient to operate, with significant heat loss, poor ventilation etc. A replacement will deliver a far more efficient building meeting modern building regulations.

Consultation and engagement

- 9.1 Limited notice of the impending building closure was necessary given the escalation of issues that brought about a decision to close. However, since the closure Council officers have met with Leith Primary School Parent Council on two occasions. Council officials have also attended meetings with the wider community organised by the Duncan Place Management Committee, and a working group has been set up to discuss the way forward. There has also been a meeting with the Chair of Edinburgh College.

Background reading/external references

Capital Asset Management Programme Priorities report to the Education, Children and Families Committee on 10 December 2013,

Gillian Tee

Director of Children and Families

Lindsay Glasgow

E-mail: lindsay.glasgow@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3312

John Bury

Acting Director of Services for Communities

Links

Coalition pledges	P40 – Work with Edinburgh World Heritage Trust and other stakeholders to conserve the City’s built heritage.
Council outcomes	CO19 - Attractive Places and Well Maintained – Edinburgh remains an attractive city through the development of high quality buildings and places and the delivery of high standards and maintenance infrastructure and public realm. CO25 – The Council has efficient and effective services that deliver on objectives.
Single Outcome Agreement	SO4 – Edinburgh’s communities are safer and have improved physical and social fabric.
Appendices	Appendix1: Duncan Place Resource Centre: User Group Relocations.

DUNCAN PLACE RESOURCE CENTRE: USER GROUP RELOCATIONS

Duncan Place Resource Centre - Classes and Groups September – December 2014

COMMUNITY GROUPS Sept – Dec 2014	DAY	TIME	Offered	Visited new venue	Accepted
Digital Skills Academy	Monday	09.30 – 12.30	Craigentinny CC	Yes	Relocated to McDonald Rd Library
Knitting Group	Monday (TBC)	09.30 – 11.00	Leith CC	Yes	Yes
Academy Arts	Monday / Friday	09.00 – 12.00	Craigentinny CC	Yes	Yes
The Alma Project (Art Group)	Monday	12.30 – 14.30	St Mary's Temp Unit (TU)	Yes	Decided to stay at SOLAS
Edinburgh Stage School	Mon (Tues & Thurs starts Sept)	19.00 – 21.00	Monday Leith CC Tues Craigentinny Thurs Fort CC	Yes	Made own arrangements
Parent and Toddler Group	Tuesday	09.30 – 11.30	Leith CC	Yes	Yes
Leith Community Council Meeting	Monday (approx. once per month)	19.00 – 21.00	Leith CC	Yes	Yes
Digital Skills Academy	Tuesday	13.00 – 16.00	Craigentinny 9.30-12.30	Yes	Relocated at HIBS stadium
Senior Woodwork/ NE Mental Health	Tuesday / Thursday	09.30 – 12.00	Castlebrae CHS and Drummond HS	Yes	These groups joined up

Team - Joinery					and some attend Castlebrae CHS and others attend Drummond HS.
Jewellery / Silverwork Club	Tuesday / Wednesday	10.00 – 12.00	Craigentiny CC	Yes	Yes
Computer Drop-In	Wednesday/Thursday	10.00 – 12.00	Craigentiny CC	Yes	Yes
The Alma Project – Art Studio	Tuesday	11.30 – 13.30	St Mary's TU	Yes	Decided to stay at SOLAS
Fabb Youth Group	Tuesday (approx every 2 nd Tuesday)	19.00 – 20.30	Fort CC	Yes	Yes
Upholstery Club	Tuesday (starts back 2/09/14)	19.00 – 21.00	St Mary's TU/alternative venues being sought.	Due to the amount of storage this group needs – we are having difficulty finding them a relocation option.	Storage is a full classroom presently in DPRC. This group would need to move to Thursday evening and upholster smaller items of furniture to operate out of TU. Discussions ongoing.

Guitar: Acoustic	Wednesday	10.00 – 12.00	Craigentiny CC	Yes	Yes
Alma Project – Creative Writing	Wednesday	14.00 – 16.00	St Mary's TU	Yes	Decided to stay at SOLAS
Look and Draw	Wednesday	18.30 – 20.45	Offered Craigentiny	Yes	No – they are currently looking for alternative venue. Want DPRC or nothing
Changeworks – Nappuccino	Thursday (last Thursday of month)	09.30 – 12.00	Leith CC	Yes	Yes
NE Mental Health Team – Pottery	Thursday	10.30 – 12.00	Inchkieth House	Yes	Yes
Café Group	Thursday (starts back 25/09/14)	10.30 – 12.30	Fort CC	Yes	Yes
Alma Project – Mixed Media	Thursday	13.30 – 15.30	St Mary's TU	Yes	Decided to stay at SOLAS
Sewing Club	Friday	09.30 – 11.30	St Mary's TU	Yes	Yes

CLD Staff

Principally relocated to Craigentiny Community centre, supplemented by fort and Royston Wardieburn Community Centres.

ADULT EDUCATION PROGRAMME starts w/b 22 nd September 2014	DAY	TIME	DURATION	Offered	Accepted
Jewellery: Silver (All)	Monday	10.00 –	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes

abilities)		12.00			
Furniture Making (Beginners)	Monday	15.00 – 17.00	18 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments
Furniture Making (Beginners)	Monday	18.30 – 20.30	18 weeks	Portobello HS	Yes
Art: Life Drawing (All abilities)	Monday	19.00 – 21.00	10 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments
Drumming: Samba (Beginners)	Monday	19.00 – 21.00	10 weeks	ST Mary's TU	Yes
Exercise: Pilates (Beginners)	Tuesday	09.30 – 11.30	10 weeks	Leith CC	Yes
Stained Glass (Post Beginners)	Tuesday	12.30 – 14.30	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Jewellery: Silver (Beginners)	Tuesday	12.30 – 14.30	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Saxophone (Beginners)	Tuesday	19.00 – 21.00	18 weeks	Leith Academy	Yes
Stained Glass (Beginners)	Wednesday	10.00 – 12.00	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Drama (All abilities)	Wednesday	10.00 – 12.00	10 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments
Upholstery (Post Beginners)	Wednesday	12.15 – 14.15	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Upholstery (All abilities)	Wednesday	19.00 – 21.00	18 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Tai Chi (All abilities)	Wednesday	19.00 – 21.00	10 weeks	St Mary's PS Gym Hall	Yes
Art: Oil Painting (All abilities)	Thursday	10.00 – 12.00	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Art: Portrait Painting & Drawing (All)	Thursday	13.00 – 15.00	10 weeks	St Mary's TU	Yes
Yoga: Hatha (Beginners)	Thursday	13.00 –	10 weeks	Fort CC	Yes

		14.30			
Woodwork (Beginners)	Thursday	18.45 – 20.45	10 weeks	Broughton HS	Yes
Guitar: Bass (Beginners)	Thursday	19.00 – 21.00	10 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments
Woodwork (All abilities)	Friday	09.30 – 11.30	10 weeks	Castlebrae CHS	Yes
Computers: Digital Photography Out & About (Beginners)	Friday	10.00 – 12.00	5 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments
Woodwork (Beginners)	Friday	13.00 – 15.00	10 weeks	Cancelled	Low enrolments

Group	Day	Time	Offered	Accepted
Leith Samba School	Tuesday	17.30 – 19.00	St Mary's TU	Yes
Mini Stage School P1 – P3 (5 – 7 years old)	Friday	13.00 – 14.30	Leith CC	Yes
Junior Stage School P4 – P7 (8 – 11 years old)	Friday	14.00 – 16.00	Leith CC	Yes
Senior Stage School (S1 – S4)	Friday	14.00 – 16.00	Leith CC	Yes

Edinburgh College Requirements

ESOL Programme	DAY	TIME	DURATION	Venue Offered	Accepted
Duncan Place Beginners = 4 mornings per week					
Beginners (16)	Monday	9-12noon	All courses run for the full academic year so from now till June 2015 (33 weeks not including academic holidays)	The Junction	Yes
Beginners (16)	Tuesday	9-12noon		The Junction	Yes
Beginners (16)	Wednesday	9-12noon		The Junction	Yes but the Junction has some prior bookings on fortnightly Weds
Beginners (16)	Thursday	9-12noon		The Junction	Yes
Mixed Level am = 4 mornings per week					
Mixed Level am (20)	Monday	9-12noon		Leith Library	Yes but partitioned space so noise issues and quite small space for 20 students
Mixed Level am (20)	Tuesday	9-12noon		Ripple Hub hall	Yes

Mixed Level am (20)	Wednesday	9-12noon		Ripple Hub hall if distance ok for students	Yes
Mixed Level am (20)	Thursday	9-12noon		Ripple Hub hall if distance ok for students	Yes
Int 1 am = 1 morning per week (+ another 2 at Southside)					
Int 1 am	Monday	9-12noon		Fort CC	Yes
Mixed Level pm = 4 afternoons per week					
Mixed Level pm (20)	Monday	12.30- 3.30pm		Craigentiny CC Moving to Leith Library in November	Attendance has been very low as difficult for students to get to and from in time for school pick ups Leith Library has been accepted but has noise issues as class in partitioned space and quite small space for 20 students
Mixed Level pm (20)	Tuesday	12.30 – 3.30pm		Ripple Hub hall	Yes
Mixed Level pm (20)	Wednesday	12.30- 3.30pm		Ripple Hub hall if distance ok for students	Yes
Mixed Level pm (20)	Thursday	12.30- 3.30pm		Ripple Hub hall if distance ok for students	Yes
EWT (English for Work and Training) = 3 afternoons per week					
EWT (20)	Monday	12.30-		Leith CC	Yes

		3.30pm			
EWT(20)	Tuesday	12.30-3.30pm		Leith CC	Yes
EWT (20)	Wednesday	12.30-3.30pm		Leith CC	Yes
Int 1 pm = 4 afternoons per week					
Int 1 pm (20)	Monday	12.30-3.30pm		The Junction	Yes but room capacity only really suitable for 16 and there are 18 currently in class with target of 20
Int 1 pm (20)	Tuesday	12.30-3.30pm		The Junction	Yes but room capacity only really suitable for 16 and there are 18 currently in class with target of 20 Some Tuesdays not available due to prior bookings
Int 1 pm (20)	Wednesday	12.30-3.30pm		The Junction	Yes but room capacity only really suitable for 16 and there are 18 currently in class with target of 20
Int 1 pm (20)	Thursday	12.30-3.30pm		The Junction	Yes but room capacity only really suitable for 16 and there are 18 currently

					in class with target of 20
Home Tutor Training					
Home Learning Tutor training (20)	Friday	10— 12noon	4 weeks	Edinburgh College Sighthill Campus	Yes
Home Learning Tutor training (20)	Friday	1-3pm	4 weeks	Edinburgh College Sighthill Campus	Yes

Numbers in () are participants i.e. Beginners (16) = room needed for 16 participants.

Edinburgh College staff and resources accommodation is still a problem as there is not enough space for these at Granton Campus. Staff are being accommodated on a temporary basis but space for resources is very limited – lots of teaching resources still in boxes.